

1 James R. Condo (#005867)
2 Kristine L. Gallardo (#033975)
3 SNELL & WILMER L.L.P.
4 One Arizona Center
5 400 E. Van Buren, Suite 1900
Phoenix, Arizona 85004-2202
Telephone: (602) 382-6000
Facsimile: (602) 382-6070
jcondo@swlaw.com
kgallardo@swlaw.com

Richard B. North, Jr. (admitted *pro hac vice*)
7 Georgia Bar No. 545599
Matthew B. Lerner (admitted *pro hac vice*)
8 Georgia Bar No. 446986
NELSON MULLINS RILEY & SCARBOROUGH LLP
9 201 17th Street, NW / Suite 1700
Atlanta, GA 30363
10 Telephone: (404) 322-6000
Facsimile: (404) 322-6050
11 richard.north@nelsonmullins.com
matthew.lerner@nelsonmullins.com

12 Attorneys for Defendants
13 C. R. Bard, Inc. and
 Bard Peripheral Vascular, Inc.

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA**

17 IN RE: Bard IVC Filters Products Liability
18 Litigation

No. 2:15-MD-02641-DGC

**DEFENDANTS' MOTION FOR
LEAVE TO FILE UNDER SEAL
EXHIBITS IN SUPPORT OF
BARD'S SEPARATE STATEMENT
OF FACTS IN SUPPORT OF
MOTION FOR SUMMARY
JUDGMENT AS TO PLAINTIFFS
DEBRA AND JAMES FRANCES
TINLIN'S CLAIMS**

24 Defendants C. R. Bard, Inc. and Bard Peripheral Vascular, Inc. (collectively
25 “Bard”) hereby respectfully move this Court, pursuant to the Stipulated Protective Order
26 (Doc. 269), Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c)(1)(G), and Local Civil Rule 5.6 for
27 leave to file under seal the exhibits attached in support of Bard’s Separate Statement of
28 Facts in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment as to Plaintiffs Debra and James

1 Frances Tinlin's Claims, served on February 1, 2019. The exhibits to the Statement of
2 Facts contain certain medical information that is protected under the Stipulated Protective
3 Order, warranting protection from public disclosure. Accordingly, there is good cause to
4 grant Defendants' Motion for Leave to File Under Seal the Exhibits in Support of Bard's
5 Statement of Facts. Plaintiffs do not oppose this Motion. A list of the Exhibits sought to
6 be sealed are attached hereto as Exhibit A.

7 **ARGUMENT AND CITATION OF AUTHORITY**

8 "When a court grants a protective order for information produced during discovery,
9 it already has determined that 'good cause' exists to protect this information from being
10 disclosed to the public by balancing the needs for discovery against the need for
11 confidentiality." *Phillips ex rel. Estates of Byrd v. Gen. Motors Corp.*, 307 F.3d 1206,
12 1213 (9th Cir. 2002). See also, *Medicis Pharm. Corp. v. Acella Pharm., LLC*, CV 10-
13 1780-PHX-JAT, 2012 WL 2260928 at *2 (D. Ariz. June 15, 2012) (sealing exhibits
14 related to "Medicis' marketing strategy, Acella's product formulation,...various e-mails
15 and deposition transcripts, viscosity test data, sales and marketing information, and
16 various other documents" because "[m]uch of this information has been previously sealed
17 by the Court, has been designated as confidential by the parties pursuant to the protective
18 order in this case, or could otherwise potentially harm the parties if released publicly
19 because of its confidential and sensitive nature.").

20 The exhibits to Bard's Statement of Facts contain certain Plaintiffs' personal
21 healthcare information that is protected under HIPAA and confidential under the
22 Stipulated Protective Order. Accordingly, good cause exists for sealing the Exhibits at
23 issue.

24
25
26
27
28

1 RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED this 1st day of February, 2019.

2 s/Richard B. North, Jr.

3 Richard B. North, Jr.

4 Georgia Bar No. 545599

5 Matthew B. Lerner

6 Georgia Bar No. 446986

7 NELSON MULLINS RILEY & SCARBOROUGH, LLP

8 Atlantic Station

9 201 17th Street, NW / Suite 1700

10 Atlanta, GA 30363

11 PH: (404) 322-6000

12 FX: (404) 322-6050

13 richard.north@nelsonmullins.com

14 matthew.lerner@nelsonmullins.com

15 James R. Condo (#005867)

16 Kristine L. Gallardo (#033975)

17 SNELL & WILMER L.L.P.

18 One Arizona Center

19 400 E. Van Buren

20 Phoenix, AZ 85004-2204

21 PH: (602) 382-6000

22 FX: (602) 382-6070

23 JCondo@swlaw.com

24 KGallardo@swlaw.com

25 **Attorneys for Defendants C. R. Bard, Inc. and**
Bard Peripheral Vascular, Inc.

Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough

201 17th Street NW, Suite 1700
Atlanta, GA 30363
L.L.P.
(404) 322-6000

EXHIBIT A

DOCUMENTS PROPOSED TO BE FILED UNDER SEAL

Defendants request they be permitted to file under seal the following documents:

1. Exhibit A to Statement of Facts – Plaintiff’s Medical Record
 2. Exhibit C to Statement of Facts – Portions of Dr. Riebe’s Deposition Transcript
 3. Exhibit E to Statement of Facts – Dr. McMeeking’s Expert Report
 4. Exhibit F to Statement of Facts – Dr. Muehrcke’s Expert Report
 5. Exhibit G to Statement of Facts – Portions of Dr. Muehrcke’s Deposition Transcript
 6. Exhibit H to Statement of Facts – Dr. Hurst’s Expert Report
 7. Exhibit I to Statement of Facts – Portions of Dr. Hurst’s Deposition Transcript